

Second Dialogue Under the UAE Work Program on Just Transition Pathways, 02nd-03rd October 2024

First Day, 02nd October 2024, 8 am – 6 pm

Opening Comments

- Climate ambition is not just about numerical targets; it is about people
- 9 out of 10 NDCs not involving adequate social dialogue
- Only 23% of collective bargaining agreements address environmental concerns
- Whole of government approach, whole of society approach, international cooperation → technology transfer, capacity development, finance

Round-table discussion: Whole-of-Society Engagement Strategy

Guiding question: How can inclusive and participatory approaches be integrated into just transition pathways to ensure that all segments of society, including vulnerable groups, are actively engaged and represented?

- How can all voices be integrated equally?
 - o One thing everyone agreed on was the importance of having social dialogues and workshops at all levels of government to ensure that voices are heard; although there are national differences, for example, countries like Colombia are very used to having social dialogues due to their political culture, whereas in other countries it might be different; this again shows that we can learn from each other, but that there is not a one-size-fits-all approach.
 - o Nevertheless, there were some insights and perspectives shared on how to improve:
 - First, it is important to adapt the screening and assessment mechanisms in terms of how and, most importantly, whom to engage; examples may include incorporating different variables into integrated assessments, such as poverty rates.
 - Some of the speakers noted that certain groups have better resources to voice their concerns and bring them to the forefront than others; it can help to segregate these dialogues and facilitate dialogues with specific groups, such as a dialogue where only indigenous issues are discussed; this also really helps to not homogenize these groups and ensure that different interests and perspectives are shared; it also allows for a more comfortable space and deeper insights into the issue to be shared.
 - Another aspect was to include stakeholder engagement in the whole project processes, that is, from the beginning to the

implementation and the overall evaluation; thus, building trust, sharing concrete results, steering towards agreements with more than one group or between government and business, such as things like tripartite agreements, as established in Denmark → Avoiding tokenism.

- Another recurring theme was the importance of cities, local governments and municipalities as they are the entities that need to implement the plans created at other levels of government.
→ There is an urgent need to strengthen their capacities and better integrate them into the governance system to improve policy coherence and avoid silo thinking. This can be done by establishing national committees, unique advisory boards or cross-cutting agencies that monitor and ensure effective and inclusive engagement and alignment between all levels of government, such as programs via ClimateWorks in Kenya.
- The last aspect that has been intensively discussed is the emphasis on mainstreaming transitions across all sectors and sections and aligning them with previous policy plans on sustainable development and climate action.
- Also: do not forget that we need international cooperation.

Discussion

- [Egypt] Opportunities vs. willingness → lack of opportunity as the main challenge although the willingness is “there”; thereby wanting to stress the importance of international cooperation as not everything can be done on the national jurisdictional level
- [Saudi Arabia] Most support was for international cooperation and adaptation; we don’t understand the selection process / the outcome of the process of the topic of this JTWP; second dialogue should include the lens of different socio-economic factors
- [Chad] NDCs are the key; huge need in energy access
- [United States of America] The targeting of specific policies goes against multilateralism

Presentations

- Institutional arrangements for policy integration and coherence (architecture, seats at the table, clear high-level direction, accountability)
- Three E’s: Enabling, Engaging, and Empowering

Breakout Session

- 1) How can the integration of upskilling, reskilling, and adaptable education systems ensure the success of just transition pathways?

- [Denmark] We need an end date so that everybody knows what we are moving towards (clear and reliable goals); tripartite agreements where everybody / all kind of different stakeholders can come together and ensure that it's just, managed, and that leaves no one behind
- [Saudi Arabia] Carbon capture and storage as a technology tool contributing to economic development; Saudi Arabia is still working on its economic diversification plan. Thus, it is very difficult to move from one specific sector to another; upskilling to embed new technologies
- [Russian Federation] Skill development is very important; Russia is paying for internships and for special training, summer schools for female professionals in the clean energy transition
- [Sudan, on behalf of LDCs] Identify synergies, how the education system might include climate change so that future generations have the capacities to react to climate resilience
- [Canada] Ensure economic opportunities, targeted initiatives
- [Senegal] We have to use gas and oil to ensure electricity access, very important to develop or to have skills, not just about energy transition but about ecological development; we want to be allowed to use the electricity that we have, we cannot only use renewables because we do not have the access and the capacities for it
- [ENGO] They should be about visioning the future and building trust, the engagement has to be multi-faceted
- [UK] UK is tackling things in a similar way; these changes require new skills; skills as a very important factor across the economy and especially for economic growth
- [Norway] Big focus is to get rid of our emissions, more electric cars right now than gasoline cars, urgent need for reskilling because mechatronics don't apply for these cars (even in the same industry)
- [Chad] Education as a key to transition
- [Seychelles]
- [Saudi Arabia] Senegal provoke an important point of common but differentiated responsibility; Saudi Arabia as part of the 'developing world', there will be countries who follow and countries who lead; all hands-on deck, nuclear energy, carbon capture and storage
- [United Arab Emirates] Partnership with IRENA to bring renewable education into the education system; apprenticeship, scholarships, etc. to improve professional skills; technology transfer and capacity building to ensure adaptable education systems
- [Yemen] (translated by Chad), Yemen is involved in the just transition and makes many awareness workshops to raise awareness among different actors and communities to encourage the youth to be part of the just transition
- [Iraq]

2) What could be the role of social protection in the context of just transition pathways that leave no one behind?

- [Senegal] We have to take into account the informal sector where there is often no social net/no social protection; what about countries that do not have a social protection system, such as LDCs? How can we discuss this question on this basis? Common but differentiated responsibility (CBDR) needs to be put into consideration about the just transition, we need to implement the loss and damages; even work that we have already started will be lost
- [ENGO] It is all about the agency of countries to act on social protection, we need to be fair and honest about the agency that countries must implement social protection
- [Saudi Arabia] Echoing and emphasizing some of the things already heard, for holistic approaches it needs to be tailored to the specific contexts
- [Chad] Funding is the key issue; we cannot make social protection without financing, and this must come from the most developed to the least developed
- [Namibia] Leaving no one behind in terms of transition; one thing that we know for sure is that transition is very expensive, former markets and livelihoods will collapse, so in terms of leaving no one behind we need to plan our strategies wisely
- [Russian Federation]

3) How can inclusive consultation practices enhance social dialogue and stakeholder engagement in the context of just transitions?

- [Guinea Bissau] Means of implementation as very important; we need the finance, we need the technology transfer, we need the capacity; knowledge gap: we have local language that is difficult to translate
- [ENGO] Just processes also need to have just outcomes; not everybody needs to be happy, but it's important on how we communicate about it
- [Senegal] Who can decide about these topics?
- [Norway] The language barrier is so important because translating is not enough but it needs explanation → we do not only need a "global language" but a way of explaining

Second Day, 03rd of October 2024, 9 am – 6 pm

Scene-setting presentation I: Innovative and Equitable Financing Mechanisms for Just Transition Pathways

- Inter-Agency Task Force on Social and Solidarity Economy (<https://unsse.org>)
- Quebec Community Financial Mechanism; France Community Finance

Scene-setting presentation II: International Cooperation and public-private partnerships

- Technology transfer as a critical piece of the energy transition puzzle
- Global megatrends: energy transition, global rebalancing, fourth industrial revolution, demographic transitions

Scene-setting presentation III: Capacity building

- Different levels of capacity development for a just transition: individual, institutional and systemic

- Whole-of-government and whole-of-society approach at a systemic level is needed! → strengthening accountability, addressing structural barriers, enhancing and facilitating social dialogue and stakeholder engagement, strengthening arrangements for policy coordination
- Key considerations for capacity-building for a just transition
 - Based on a sound understanding of needs and gaps
 - Ownership and active role of participant
 - Not only training – coaching, peer-to-peer, networks
 - Plans for application and follow-up support
 - Gender and social inclusion considerations in the design and implementation of capacity building activities
 - Sustainability (transfer & dissemination)
- Evaluating and measuring
 - How knowledge is applied
 - Process and outcome indicators
 - Co-design – what counts for participants
 - ...

Breakout Discussion

1) How could international cooperation and public-private partnerships be designed to leveraged to accelerate and sustain technology transfer for just transitions of the work force in developing countries while fostering inclusivity?

- [ENGO] Intellectual property rights are still in the GN (e.g., 70% of the money for technology transfer goes to students in the UK who are going to the GS) → what are the structural solutions as a means of implementation?
- [FAO] Often do not look at accessible technology; we need to broaden our understanding of what technology is practical, accessible, affordable and can be created on a local level → need to do assessments on the local level
- [Chad] We need action
- [Sudan] issue of intellectual property rights
- [Netherlands] Green hydrogen market: the Netherlands has a partnership with Namibia
- [Guinea-Bissau] involve private sectors in all processes around just transitions; different countries have different needs; have contributed differently to climate change; LDCs and SIDS will suffer the most; we exported rice but due to climate change and sea level rise we need to import rice, no technology to really be resilient, countries like the Netherlands have the technology and I saw what resources they have to protect, we need the finance, we need the technology to protect ourselves
- [Norway] there is the opportunity to update NDCs and there will also be the opportunity to update the technology needs in the context of a just transition; if you have this, then you are more likely to get the funding, vital green data base
- [Malawi] It is also essential to talk about which technologies we don't need and talk about technology dumping which is taking place in the GS
- [Somalia] establishing a framework between the private, public, and the international sector could be an important step
- [ENGO] ... the right of citizens to regulate these public-private partnerships

2) How could financing mechanisms for just transition of the work force be designed to overcome investment barriers in developing countries and reach those in the most vulnerable countries?

- [Azerbaijan] Baku initiative for climate finance which is designed to support and encourage investment platforms that link to just transition aspects; we need enablers to access the funds and especially to fasten the access; climate finance action fund as another mechanism that is specifically about supporting the projects, adaptation and mitigation, for developing countries, the difference is that it has rapid response mechanisms and easy access mechanisms to the fund
- Can all developing countries apply to the fund? → Yes
- [UK] wide range of support that is available, UK is providing support such as the climate investment fund, the NDC partnership, that integrate just transitions aspects; just one example where we supporting Egypt's green hydrogen flagship project, where we are funding the construction of different RE projects; also I want to mention the report on climate finance on regard to financing just transitions, it reference a range of mechanisms e.g., environmental taxes, investments to derisk climate change
- [Denmark] We, Denmark, and the EU in general provided a lot of finance to ILO and Denmark is highly inspired by what has come out of the ILO; I want to mention the NDC partnership as Denmark is co-chairing it together with Ruanda, it's a global coalition which always centered on people-centric ..., countries can apply for whatever they need, there is a global call right now by designing the current and upcoming NDCs; Denmark is trying to redirect its financial development away from fossil fuel and gas toward RE's
- [Russian Federation] 1% of our GDP annually goes to developing countries, we have an adaptation finance gap that we need to close, we voluntary contribute to the Global Climate Fund
- [ENGO] One important area is dept and issues around inequality about cost and capital access, the problem we have is that there is no coherent pathway, we need something coherent and systemic; if we look at IRENA, we found that the African continent has only received less than 3 % for renewable energy development; we need to ensure that the JTWP includes the structural debates and brings them into the program itself
- [Chad] Aligning just transition and NDC and aligning NDCs with just transition
- [Sudan] Investment into just transition is an investment into our collective future, the provision of finance is very important, low-carbon development pathway and climate resilience as key pieces for equitable transitions, LDCs have the least responsibility, focusing on increasing grant based over loans, financial mechanisms need to offer better accessibility and ensure equitable access to climate and development fund with special allocation for LDCs, adaptation and just transition pathway need to go hand in hand and finance can close this gap, we need to scale up capacity building efforts, and knowledge sharing and have to stop technology dumping
- [Facilitators] How can investment barriers can be overcome and reach the most vulnerable?

- [Namibia] Although we have done the vulnerability assessment, unfairness in support according to the separation of vulnerability, Namibia is not as vulnerable as for example Vanuatu but still should get climate finance due to struggles beyond vulnerability, African countries are getting very little climate finance
 - [Netherlands] Coalition of finance ministers for climate action¹, Netherlands co-chairing with Indonesia, how to make the ministries of finance more included into the financial processes
 - [Senegal] One example I want to share is the JETP. I want to compare two situations here: if I look at how the transition is financed in Europe, they have a lot of subsidies for families to help finance their solar system. In the terms of JETP we were trying to establish residential solar systems. It was very interesting with the 2.5 \$. Less than 10% will come as subsidies, there is a lot of credit that they want to give us, it's really too heavy for us. We still don't know the interest rate that will be applied to this money, we want to learn from these countries and other continents; if we sign partnerships like this it will be more, it can be more if they accept the same conditions in Europe or in Germany as for us; 60% of the cost in Germany is paid in the form of subsidies, but in this partnership it is not possible for us, although it could be an incentive for us for the vulnerable population; at the international level we need to be more cooperative and to be more, to find a way how to give us more, because we want to make this transition, but if you have to pay this money, if you have to pay this interest rate, so it will never reach the intended goals.
 - [Facilitator] Self-reduction and self-consumption are really interesting cases; there is a whole toolbox that should be mobilized, and these kinds of incentives should be included in it
 - [Facilitator] You raised the importance of knowledge-sharing; there are many countries that have created solar PV systems on a residential basis, and I invite those countries for informal exchange on this
 - [Cuba]
 - [ENGO] Taxation is important to talk about; where that finance could be redirected and, especially to those who are most vulnerable
- 3) How can capacity building efforts be enhanced to contribute to the successful implementation of just transition strategies in developing countries, and what metrics can be used to measure the effectiveness and inclusiveness of capacity building programs in preparing workers and communities for these transitions?

Reflections: Plenary Session

- Local examples (breakout session 4)
 - o Kenia: community climate gatherings
 - o Québec: trade union workers funding, tax incentives by government
 - o Stronger participation of local municipalities
- Six key themes (breakout session 5)
 - o Support the intellectual property rights (open source)

¹ <https://www.financeministersforclimate.org>.

- Private sectoral role and public-private partnership: engaging the private sector, incentives, examples on Columbia and Brazil on a consultative basis, enabling the private sector to access climate finance, joint investment platforms
- Acknowledgments of potential risks: lower protection of human rights, the private sector should be regulated in a way that the protection of human rights is ensured
- CCS and green hydrogen
- Capacity Building (breakout session 6)
 - Gaps of finance and resources (GS countries)
 - Both developing and developed countries need capacities, although the needs are different
 - Domestic and enabling environment is important for capacity building
 - Different actors require capacity building, e.g. Indigenous, youth, gender, workers and communities, and academia
 - When it comes to government, it was acknowledged that different line ministries need to enhance their capacities
 - Importance of reskilling and upskilling when it comes to the workforce
 - Recognize that there is local knowledge and capacity that can be leveraged
 - Value of conducting a mapping of initiatives and programs that are relevant for capacity building for just transition → e.g. establishing a hub within the JTWP
 - Importance of gender disaggregated data
- Discussion / Open Comments, Statements
 - [Egypt, on behalf of G77 and China] It is very much evident that the issue of the means of implementation was addressed in a comprehensive matter and that it was not restricted to the just transition in a workforce; most of the interventions were on low-carbon and resilient economies; we have a suggestion to amend the title of this breakout discussion to reflect the real discussions and that would align with the reporting to “Unpacking the full range of means of implementation (Finance, Technology and Capacity Building) for a people-centric just transition”, without mentioning of the workforce
 - [Arab Group] Request to include in the budget plan also financing for developed countries to finance a just transition; we would also like to highlight that finance is needed for adaptation and resilience and not only for mitigation
 - [Norway] World Café format is really good to work under and gives a very free form to work under, I also have the impression we have more in common than what separates us; we should keep listening and learning from each other, this format has helped to start forming this dialogue,

personally, I noticed, that several of us are working on the same topics but from completely different angles which is good to see our work through the eyes of other experiences

- [Burkina Faso, on behalf of the LDC] We align ourselves to the statement by Egypt and the G77, we really look forward to the action, it is really important to focus on the means of implementation wherever we are; we must make sure that we bring on board local expertise on how to leverage finance and local contexts, we can readjust and can move forward
- [Bolivia] There are a lot of differences between all countries; not every country can be useful to another one as we are at different stages and have different goals when it comes to climate action, on behalf of the LDCs, we are aligning with what the G77 has raised; the work force needs a just transition, but just transitions are way broader, we previously set a finance goal that has not yet been met in a timely manner
- [Somalia] We want to highlight the critical need for concrete action, we emphasize all parties to continue this work, let's move forward with action towards a just transition that leaves no one behind, especially in countries such as Somalia
- [Brazil] We align ourselves with the G77, empathizes the importance and meaningful implementation of just transition when we talk about means of implementation; we need to talk about CBDR
- [Panama] These discussions are fundamental, especially for vulnerable countries like Panama; we reached a milestone in our environmental journey last year, however, as a developing nation, we are struggling with financial depth, the need for reskilling and new economic opportunities, addressing these challenges requires international cooperation, accessible and timely finance, we are a carbon negative country, one of our indigenous communities has already been forced to deallocate due to sea level rise, debt burden and access to finance as the main challenges
- [Samoa, on behalf of AOSIS], Goals need to be aligned with the latest signs, adequate climate finance for loss and damages, significant evidence to show that access to financial resources is difficult for SIDS
- [Chad] Emphasizing the needs again for LDCs and African countries
- [BINGO] Implementation on the ground which requires equitable financing and developed and meaningful participation of all stakeholders, the next round of NDCs is a critical point which can support concrete action and implementation, enabling an environment for the private sector to invest is needed, involvement of business sector and private sector is crucial, we also want to highlight the existing solutions that we have, and we are looking forward to the next steps of this process
- [European Union] The historical decision in Dubai confirms this, the crucial role of the energy sector in ensuring a transition in an orderly and

just manner, including taking action in just transition and I support Norway, although we have different challenges we talked a lot and exchanged experiences, the transition should also need high social standards in promoting human rights and ensuring gender equality, inclusive multi-sectoral, multi-actor strategies, we cannot agree to stripe out the work force from the working title as it was part of the dialogue today

- [United States] We agree with Norway and others on the importance of labor rights and that our national strategies are inclusive; the work program is here to share experiences and not a vehicle to judge any policies; just transition is for all countries, we would agree with the EU to not cross out the work force from the title because it would feel a bit unfair
- [Women and Gender Constituency] We keep on missing key points: we need to move away from growth based economic model, we need to change the finance system so that it meets the needs of “communities” and not the other way round, procedural justice as such important component
- [Lebanon] We want to agree with the point of WGC that extreme poverty and gender violence have not been touched enough on, also war; I want to stress that the reality of Lebanon there cannot be a serious conversation on just transition considering the situation right now, the diplomatic situation was utterly missing on just transition and especially international cooperation, I stress to include this challenge in this final report, and thanks to everybody who expressed their solidarity with Lebanon these days such as YOUNGO and WGC
- [Egypt] We wanted to bring some very brief comments here with regard to changing the title: we heard from their intervention that we need to address a whole of economy, a whole of society, that women, that indigenous people should be included; thus, this all go beyond the workforce, the workforce is a very male dominated sector, so all these other groups need to be reflected in the JTWP that goes beyond the workforce; otherwise, we have a title or guiding question that does not reflect even the co-facilitators

Discussion on International cooperation and partnerships for people-centric and equitable just transitions

- [Samoa, on behalf of AOSIS and SIDS] JETP model needs to be designed to the needs of SIDS, and it must ensure that sufficient finance capacity building and more grants than concessional loans
- [Colombia] Over 70 % of climate finance comes from domestic levels, 90 % of the international financial contributions are loans

- [Kenya] Financial mechanism should be designed in a way that they do not need to further ineptness
- [USA] We are not accepting any references to numbers on climate finance in the JTWP as we have the NCQG
- [Chair] This is a dialogue, not a negotiation. Thus, we do not have to agree on a definition of just transitions; we get a richer understanding of what just transition would mean for different parts of the world