

1st Dialogue of the JTWP

Date and Time: 02-03 June 2024, 1pm-5pm and 8am-12pm (CEST)

Location: World Conference Centre Bonn

Attended by: Ana Paola Gonzalez Alonso, Climate Strategies

Agenda:

https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/resource/20240525_WEB%20VERSION_Detailed%20Agenda%20-%20First%20Hybrid%20Dialogue%20of%20the%20Work%20programme%20on%20just%20transition%20pathways.pdf

First day: 02.06.24

Opening plenary

Nabeel Munir SBI chair

- Opportunity to address climate change without leaving people behind. Empower communities, protect workers rights and foster green economies.
- JT is about building a future with social justice and sustainability hand in hand.

Harry Vreuls SBASTA chair

- Objective to discuss experience, policies and approaches for integrating JTs into NDCs, NAPs and LT-
- NDCs are part of Paris long term goals. 2025 submissions, countries are encouraged to set ambitious targets aligned to 1.5. NAPs requires medium and long term adaptation needs (gender sensitive, inclusive and participatory). Need to identify vulnerable and at-risk communities. LT-LEDS guide nations to these goals regarding their contexts.

Ms. Iman Ustadi (deputy chief negotiator COP28 presidency)

- JTWP is a cornerstone of UAE consensus achieved in COP28.
- Key to ensure as we make a way to ambition we also ensure sustainable development without leaving anyone behind.
- JT debate puts forward how to operationalize sustainable development.
- JT should put forward a tangible approach to equity.
- Put forward international cooperation to keep 1.5
- Inclusivity principle must continue to drive approach to JT. Much integrated approach in principles that value people (social participation, reduce hunger and ineq).
- We need to go beyond mitigation to include resilience. Need to consider unique characteristics of indigenous populations.

- Topic is very relevant and critical. To show how we can keep international cooperation at the heart.
- The JTWP is uniquely positioned for a pragmatic solution → investment framework, how to make it equitable, how can we integrate communities and enhance resilience, ensure food and water and job security while we transition, what role does technology transfer and capacity building play?
- No transition at the expense of livelihoods.
- Coordinated approach to learn from each other and address challenges. → true collaboration and cooperation.
- Set of principles, processes and practices that aim to ensure that no people are left behind in transition from high carbon to low carbon economy.

Simon Stiell

- We are on the cusp of an unprecedented transformation that will unlock new jobs and opportunities. Things will change. This transformation cannot happen without safety net. NDCs need to include support for workers in affected sectors (reskilling and upskilling).
- Need support to change way of life. Together created support for people affected in these societies. Need the proper financial means.
- Just and equitable transition → share your experiences and solutions and show us how to integrate them into NDCs, NAPs and LT strategies.
- We need to start making concrete plans, policies based on engagement and dialogues.
- Let this dialogue empower governments to act in unison with communities, private sector and key stakeholders.
- There is no one size one fits all → each solution needs to adapt to context developing or developed, rural or...
- This dialogue almost did not happen because of the lack of funds.
- Let's give people a voice, set the policies and regulatory frameworks. Let's make NDCs, NAPs and LT strategies implementable and impactful.

Jim Skea IPCC

- When I was head of transition in Scotland
- Challenge to change international dialogues into actionable policies that actually improve people's lives.
- JTs involve procedural justice
- Action at local level have implications in int system via trade for example.
- 6th synthesis report → JT 3 (mitigation) and 2 (adaptation) embrace the JT concept. JT varies according to context but core elements → investments, research of social impacts, social dialogue and demo consultation, creation of decent work,

fairness in energy access and use, eco diversification, training and retraining, gender specific policies, fostering int cooperation and coord action, consideration of intergenerational justice concerns (policy impacts of future generations).

- Scope of term has expanded (COP23 coal) now out of fossil to low carbon and renewable, from mitigation to resilience and adaptation, from energy to agriculture, transport and...
- Need for indigenous and local knowledge.
- Make it a manageable structure while remaining cognizant of the fact that we are talking about people's lives.

Manal Shehabi Oxford

- Create a new definition universal acceptance, flexible and includes CBDR
- Focus on equity
- Develop an integrative inclusive process also incorporated in NDCs, NAPs and LTs
- Significant challenges to design pathways: climate change impacts different in different groups, energy and trade measures with different impacts, rising inequalities, not enough data for people neg impacted, new risks (disrupted supply chains, distant islands different challenges)
- Policy and procedural challenges → multiple obligations of parties, silos in policymaking targets, difficult and significant trade offs between eco, environmental, energy policies, also exacerbate vulnerabilities in vulnerable people, lack of implementation support (finance and tech)
- JTs are a must to achieve climate justice. Only 23% NDCs mention and 56% of LT-LEDs mention (26% dedicated chapter)
- Recommendations: start with an impact assessment (with inclusive and participatory approach).
- Design and monitoring: include goals and indicators, cohesive policies need to be design, gender-based analysis and targets (not only in mitigation but also in adaptation), incorporate indigenous knowledge, design adaptive social protective measures that can minimize impact and max benefits.
- Implementation and monitoring: eliminate silos, incorporate measures and indicators in the context of SDG, monitor asses and report targets concurrently.
- Inclusive approaches are important → in formulation, integration, assessment and implementation. Support from various avenues, local, regional or international is needed. + include lessons from already successful experiences. Need for international cooperation and regional programmes.

Breakout Group 1 GENF Room: Vanuatu, Australia, Belgium, EU, Gabon, Trinidad and Tobago, Norway, Botswana, Togo, Samoa, Nicaragua, Senegal, Grenada, Suriname, TUNGO, Indonesia, Nauru, Angola, Egypt, ENGO, Algeria, Kuwait, Vietnam, Mozambique.

Topic1: Inclusive approaches to the development of NDCs, NAPs, and LT-LEDs and other policies (identifying and engaging stakeholders)→ opportunities, practices but also challenges and barriers.

- *How are parties adopting an inclusive and participatory approach that leaves no one behind in developing their NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDs?*
- *What means can ensure that people in vulnerable situations benefit from the opportunities of the just transition and that NDCs/NAPs/LT-LEDs leverage their role as agents of change, while also minimizing risk?*

2 Ice-Breaker Presentations

Colin Matisse from Belize

- Our consultation activities for NDCs started in 2020
- Development of a consultation plan with key objectives and key stakeholders, methodologies for consulting stakeholders → we developed a report.
- Key stakeholders: technical working group on behalf of NDC partnership; also another modelling working group; also blue carbon working group; data sources (existing resource finding), activity owners (projects and activities relevant) and policy experts (social feedback -11 govts); NDC facilitator; live engagement tracker that gave info on who needs to be consulted.
- Also focus group sessions. We tried to consult different sectors but also focus groups with indigenous people.
- Challenges, not a lot of representation to women organizations. No participation from municipal level.

Australia – Steven Bran

- NDCs, NAPs...communicate climate policies for action. Why should we focus on this, because it helps mitigation policy bringing us closer to Paris goals.
- Identify opportunities for reskilling and upskilling +preparing young people for transition.
- Programme supporting decarbonization plans.
- Sustainable and equitable solutions require inclusive policy making → not only box ticking. Central to involve communities in managing and coordinating the shift to net zero.
- Roundtables, workshops, consultation papers.
- Inclusive...partnership → partnership with PNG to make solar energy more affordable. Focus on women and...
- Need enabling regulatory environments → public and private investments.

iForest

- Process of stakeholder consultation at national level will be fundamentally different (that one is more in identifying experts and then opening to broader participation) but JT is broader, we need to consult at sub-national and local levels. Engage with communities, labour unions, etc, also need to consult indirect and induced economies being impacted. → Need to come up with frameworks of consultation for those indirectly impacted.

Bert de Well (ITUC) TONGO

- Support approach/scope of JTWP on international cooperation and workforce (labor rights mentioned).
- No cherry picking. → decent work and quality jobs.
- NDCs, NAPs, LT → ambitions are lowered sometimes because of the risks of job loss → might be true or not but needs to be consulted with the groups that will be affected.
- Difference between social dialogue and stakeholder consultation → the 1st one is the 3-partite ILO.

EU

- Important to include JT in NAPs, NDCs and LT-LEDS so we are happy about the topic.
- Displaced people, people with different capabilities → different vulnerabilities which need to be considered.
- JTs as a process → social dialogue with trade unions as well as stakeholder engagements will help build public support to create plans that are sustainable, feasible to implement.
- Important of creating Systems that can be reviewed and adapted. Examine them against specific needs of the different transitions.

Grenada

- Need for social dialogue but also government, business, trade unions, academic community, researchers → link social dialogue with livelihood enhancement at subnational levels.
- Enhancement of creation of jobs.

ENGO -Javier Davalos AIDA

- Scope of the JTWP is guided by dimension of transition but also social and eco dimensions of the paris agreement. Think about the differences of JTs in GN and GSouth.
- Pressure of Critical minerals is having the same challenges of fossil fuels.
- Int coop as a key enabler is really important for this work programme.

- The importance of JTWP is vital for the implementation of paris agreement.
- How are you choosing the people that support you in creating the NDCs, NAPs, LT-LEDS?

Trinidad and Tobago

- We just drafted a JT policy → our process mandated to have consultation and engagement as an institutionalized process.
- In developing NDCs, NAPs, LT-LEDS semi quantitative modelling of impacts of implementing NDCs needs to be taken into account, also gaps and impacts identified. Adaptation aspects can be a little more tricky because of informality of work sector for example (retooling, reskilling,...) need to be carefully identified because if not you can create a greater gap.

Topic2: Policy coherence for implementing JTs pathways (enabling implementation)

- *How can JTs pathways be effectively mainstreamed in implementing NDCs/NAPs/LT-LEDS?*
- *How can a whole-of-government approach support the implementation of NDCs/NAPs/LT-LEDS that incorporate JT pathways? How can it be ensured that these policies are coherent with national development priorities and other international commitments?*

1 Ice-Breaker Presentation

Belgium, Catherine Widely

- Essential to improve dialogue of govs and civil society on issues to climate change.
- Federal gov launched the Estates General for JT → 4 streams of work for 2 years. 1) academics definition, concepts, challenges, task with a report to answer how to organize and implement; 2) citizens agora to place them at the heart of deliberations what conditions need transition meet to be fair?; 3) forum (based on ILO guidelines) with civil society (trade unions,...) to ask for their concerns, ideas and experiences; 4) Public services each charged to list policies that were charged to implement JT as well as their role and competencies.
- We were presidency of council of EU → We asked an exploratory opinion so that there are recommendations to realize a more comprehensive JT policy framework in the EU.
- Really important to think as JT as an inclusive process and not only as outcome. It's a continuous process. Focus on most affected sectors and populations.

TUNGO (Bert de Wel)

- Climate environment ministries go to COP and take decisions, Ministries of Labor go to ILO conferences...what we notice is that when ministers go back they don't speak with each other to see how to implement the policies that are discussed.

Egypt

- We in Egypt look into JT in a comprehensive way to reflect a low carbon economy and resilient one. We are willing to go beyond specific sectorial transitions in a more comprehensive approach. We want to be guided by experiences of others that were successful to transition from old model of development to the new model of development.
- Social, eco, environmental aspects of development need to be taken into account. We cannot follow one path. Pathways are wide, different and need to reflect national circumstances.

iForest

- What do we mean by JT pathways → trajectory? If that is the case it'll be similar to development trajectory but JTs are not only numbers but focused on livelihoods.
- Pathways is confusing term.
- JT is both process and outcome, it means we need to be clear in justice in process and justice in outcome (e.g., level of inclusiveness, is it better than before) we need to develop matrix.
- Impact matrix, opportunity matrix, finance matrix (domestic, private, public, int), governance matrix (whole of gov w=but who), stakeholder matrix, capacity matrix (skilling, re-skilling...).

ENGO (Climate Action..International)

- Are we considering the international part of JTs (int coop and climate finance).

Angola

- We want to hear the experiences from the economies that transit from the fossil fuels based economy to the sustainable economies. In our case, we are an oil exporter. We want an ambitious NDC and encourage to invest in green energies but according to our national priorities we need to focus on other problems, health, education and not only invest on JT. How do we implement first our original NDCs.
- We really came here to try to understand the concept better and hear experiences of those who have done it.

BINGO (Robert int org of employers)

- When it comes to coherence it becomes more clear when looking at sub-national contexts and within specific sectors.

- We also need to bring coherence at international level happening at other organizations like ILO. → need to streamline that info +including for this the work of NDCs partnership.

LinkedIn

- Great point that different ministries need to be talking.
- Jobs as a risk that needs to be mitigated but ambition can be unlock by being clear about opportunities → we need to start using data.
- Ministries need to speak “the same language”.
- Present both opportunities and risks to workers.
- Jobs will be changed → average job will have a skills turnover of 25%.

IGO

- Do parties have some learnings and observations on how to make it work? Strong anchoring at the higher level of → can help signal commitment.
- Dedicated taskforces → do they work for increased coordination?
- Do Ministries really not speak same language? Do we need to have capacity-building spaces?
- Common indicators and targets could help across-ministries?
- What about vertical coherence, not only horizontally. Need for frameworks that are responsive locally.

Trinidad and Tobago

- JT implementation strategy → we have principles of integration. E.g., should implement by integrate sectoral policies, revise relevant legislation, incorporate updated vision as planning policy and use it to guide the JT policy. Requiring energy and other relevant policies to include and analyze and assess impacts of JTs to also demonstrate that JTs principles are integrated.

Asian Development Bank – Kate Hughes

- Need to make sure that there are resources available.
- Modelling and analytical formats in NDCs but JTs modelling is less developed. Specific stakeholder mapping related to JTs which is diff to NDC mapping.
- Supporting not only preparation but implementation -> for that finance is needed → whole of gov approach and falls under budget of different ministries but also cross-sectorial approaches it can be difficult to determine whose budget JT falls under.
- Sequencing → Needs money alongside decarb and mitigation policies. JTs finance with JT as main focus is needed.

Vanuatu

- We are so small that we have to take this all of government approach.
- Very high-level board. Finance, justice, agriculture all on the board of JTs policies. On that board also private sector and Civil Society.
- Not enough to have only bureaucrats but also politicians (all MPs one declaration). We then took it to the region → ...villa call for a fossil fuel free pacific.
- Climate and disaster communities set the agenda (provincial and community ones) → they design their own JTs plans.

UNDP health

- Climate and health links are very strong.
- Health data might be useful to measure process and outcome of JTs.
- Occupational lens is central also to a JT.

TUNGO

- Support the need for criteria and indicators. But wanted to stress that economic modelling approaches led by consultants that then leave the country cannot be translated unless the people make it their own.

Topic 3: Experience in incorporating JT pathways into NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDS (Analysis, policy development and lessons learned)

- *Which practices/frameworks/strategies and related governance mechanisms have been helpful to incorporating just transition pathways into NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDS and in your view should inform the next round of NDCs/NAPs/LT-LEDS?*
- *What have been key challenges or pitfalls? What kind of assessments and diagnostics helped to include just transition considerations in the NDCs/LT-LEDS/NAPS? What kind of assessments and diagnostics are useful to give effect to just transition considerations that were included in the NDCs/NAPs/LT-LEDS?*

Chair Presentations

Sangju Lee UNDP

- Principles of JT reflected in 38% of NDCs. But more work can be done to really integrate JTs, not many have measures.
- JTs in relation of green jobs, but not enough info about gender and impacts.
- 4 building blocks to look into key building blocks → assessment (impact assessment of costs and benefits shared); engagement (bring everyone onboard through meaningful participation → co-defining); institutional policy and capacity support; finance (mobilizing resources for transition hot- and blind-spots).

Mustapha Kamal Gueye ILO

- Transitioning will generate 100million jobs but how do you maximize benefits → with capacity building (reskilling and upskilling)
- Where are the skills matching with the climate ambitions?
- High skills of energy sectors are 36% in other economic sectors this is 25% average.
- Of the transition created work only 20million would go to women → need a gender focus.
- Workers shifting from fossil fuels to clean energy are not getting better wages. This question of quality of jobs is important.
- Protection → social security is important in mitigation and adaptation strategies. In the 20 most vulnerable countries to climate change only 10% of vulnerable populations have access to security.
- Impact of heat stress → working time will be lost. But also occupational safety and health. How do we manage this? We need comprehensive policy frameworks.

2 Ice-Breaker Presentations

EU commission (Fabio.dominico.eu?)

- EU Transition framework includes strategies and targets, guidance and monitoring,
- Strategies and targets = European Green Deal and European Climate Law.
- 20 principles of European pillars of social rights and 3 headline targets.
- European Skills Agenda and Pact for Skills
- Guidance and monitoring
- Also funds: social climate fund (part will be used to support the most vulnerable)

Senegal

- JT partnership (IPGS) concluded with EU, France, Germany, Canada and the UK.
- JT= People centric development.
- Because of our national context, we need to concentrate on only a few topics energy security and food security.
- We spend 1.5billion USD to import fossil fuel products. → transitioning is important.
- We strengthen deployment of green energy into our energy mix. 2.5billion EUR in new additional financing to help to reach this.
- This year Senegal will stop producing gas. It is important to use this gas in a transitional way to produce electricity and not only renewable energy so that we can give people energy access. It was difficult to find this common agreement with the partners that are helping us with the partnership. We still don't have an investment because we cannot agree on how much is loan and how much is credit. Interest rate is also not clear.

- We need to first understand the financing to conclude plan. After that our aim is to reduce emission by 30%.
- Despite the problems we try to continue to develop LT-LEDS vision. We are working on this, it is better to find solutions with partners to integrate JETPs into NDCs, NAPs, and LT-LEDS.
- Cement production sector needs to be decarbonized→ if we manage to put it together with JETPS and all strategies these can really help to reduce emissions.

Egypt

- We understand the challenges of implementing JETPs.
- Implementation and focus of implementation → so far the dialogue focuses more on the formulation of new policies but we want to see more focus on the challenges that GSouth faces in implementing current NDCs. And we are now requested to increase ambition while we don't have the guidance on how to implement NDCs.
- International Cooperation magnitude other countries have within their policies.
- We are on common understanding that JT pathways are different. We see a lot of focus from developed countries regarding workforce but from our perspective it needs to include the whole economy. It should provide pathways to transition to low emission models of economy.
- In Global south we have formal and informal economies that also needs to be addressed.
- Pathways to sust dev and poverty eradication

Australia

- NDCs and...are meant to communicate policies that are already or on the way.
- Net zero carbon authority was created, is facilitating investment, policy coherence,..
- New policies are aligned with local needs.
- Worth to build on community led efforts.
- Clear narrative on workforce transition can be challenging.
- Recognizing that transitions extend beyond the workers in the sector but also to other workers in the area.

TUNGO (Bert de Wel)

- Element of timing in incorporating JT in NDCs. Spain has done a very comprehensive approach region by region, even there timing was key to get support.
- JTs plans that are well negotiated and are pro-active are crucial.

- Skills and extra skills → we see often that workers from fossil fuel sectors have certificates and when they move they have to do it again and the burden is put on the worker.
- Do we really have a skills shortage or just bad wages?
- Skills are mostly acquired on the job the main thing is to give them good contracts.

iForest

- We will have more jobs in green economy but jobs will not be at the same place (e.g. RUR in Germany)
- Where will jobs be created and where lost → need mapping.
- Short term objective of revising NDCs with lens of JTs is suboptimal. We need an actual JT economic transition plan → then your NDCs, NAPs, LT will get updated on their own.
- We will see a massive restructuring of economy! Everything will change. We need to view JT from that lens.

-Having something on NDCs about JTs shows political will (UNDP)

Granada

- Second NDC in 2020.
- Social dialogue, whole of society approach in formulation of NDCs
- How does that drive implementation of the NAPs, NDSs and LT?
- Having just transition incorporated is not enough, it's through active involvement.

Trinidad and Tobago

- We did ex post and ex ante (financial implementation and investment plan and then assessed impacts; for the next round we need socio-eco and impact modelling)
- Challenges: quantifying socio-eco impacts. → call for robust modeling.
- In engaging with stakeholders → key is how to message JTs. It should not be seen as a threat as you need buy in.

ADB

- Analytical work and data needs to recognize the level of informality of the workforce and the difficulties to get that data, as well as how hard it is for them to get engaged.
- Heavy focus on integrating this in NDCs but they are due next year and so this should be a starting process to include JTs not necessarily in just the next one
- Unjust costs and impacts → we need to really understand.
- We need to be realistic whether including JTs in NDCs is the fastest way to implementation.

BINGO

- Whole of economy shift that is necessary we also need all workers across all society and sectors to be developing green skills.
- Demand for jobs that require green skills are growing 2x as fast as the development of those skills.
- We focus on jobs created and lost but we also need to focus on jobs that are being changed (green digital and...transition happening together)
- Training we think it comes from schools or labour ministry but often it actually happens within their current work → role of current employers.
- Skills based view is very important.

ENGO

- Importance of civil society in determining JT pathways at local level.
- Strategies that have been helpful → oil field Ecuador in Yasuni national park was decided by people.
- For countries dependent on oil, it is important that the JTWP help identify challenges of countries.
- Need for financial need to transition.

Co-chairs wrap up

-How to make JT a driver for that implementation of NDCs (also adds to the narrative point)

-Need for robust eco models and assessment (so that countries can anticipate risks and see where they are going) → would also capture the specificities of different countries economies.

-Social engagement and social dialogue.

Second day 03.06.24

Topic 4: Identifying support needs

- *How are support needs being identified at the local/national/regional/international levels?*
- *What is needed to support better integration of just transition consideration in the next round of NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDS goals?*

Co-chairs remarks

Miriam Hinostroza

- International cooperation is crucial. It has been providing capacity building, it's been crucial to building local expertise, strengthening international frameworks and governance structures.
- We claim that int cooperation ensures that policies are harmonized. Cooperation should prevent actions in one country have negative repercussions in others.
- International cooperation also to set indicators and metrics to make sure efforts are comparable.
- Transparency reports are also due to December 2024.
- International cooperation should ensure that the transition benefits all society. Promotes global solidarity.
- JTs needs international collaboration.
- Identifying needs international collaboration. Consultation processes that are inclusive are in-line with UN principles. UNEP provides help with that.

Estefania Adila Robles NDC Partnership

- Example mechanisms at the global level that are working with countries in identifying needs and matching them with those that can support them.
- We aim to advance the Paris Agreement goals and at the same time the SDGs.
- Identify implementation priorities, collect those systematically and bring them to the front of implementing development partners. Over 6000 request for support, since 2020 we have launched a global call to support prep of NDCs 2.0 and LT-LEDS. → Now over 50 countries requesting this support.
- Articulating needs is not always obvious → parties and institutions collaborations is key.

1 Ice-Breaker Presentation

Trinidad and Tobago

- Financial and technical support are the main concerns.
- We developed a draft JT policy that looks at all aspects of the transition not only workers but also adaptation. Livelihoods of communities (subsistence farming or fishing) also needs to be accommodated. → we need to consider all aspects to really no one is left behind.
- Detailed implementation plan → which gave the opportunity to see what is required.
- Looking at technology needs assessment
- Challenge has been to capture all of the informal workers not only direct impacts but also those that provide support services to the sector that you are planning to transition.
- Assessing in totality those impact has been a challenge. Technical support to model those impacts is a gap in our assessment.

- What is needed to support better implementation → socio-economic modelling. Our NDCs is based on a business-as-usual baseline. For the next one, because baseline is based on socio-economic context/circumstances we are now seeing if that baseline is still true.
- Technical and financial support need to be brought for the granular needs that come up.
- What contingency plans need to be put in place?
- Assess gaps for what exists at the moment and try to address them for future NDCs. Modelling needs to help in that.
- We are also looking at a job assessment for (reskilling, upskilling, retooling). It is difficult to assess those works because of the dynamics of the sectors. A comprehensive job assessment of the existing and future job force is needed.

Asian Development Bank

- Identifying support needs, we provide technical assistance, we have a support platform. We found that needs do differ from other climate change support because a lot of work has to be done before the start of the needs assessment. A lot of capacity building work goes into it.
- Identifying a right counterpart for the support is an issue. Which ministry is the main focal point → hard.

Egypt

- I would have liked to see not only identifying the needs but would like to see reflected the implementation → financial support.
- The EU presented their strategy (comprehensive) for their transition. We need to mimic that, on the other side we see how complicated the experience of countries with JETPs has been.
- Developing countries are being pushed to a very narrow sectorial transition → we don't start on same ground.
- I would have liked to see the in the EU presentation the numbers that were needed to make this transition happen. It would be great to have that info and replicate it in the developing world.

TUNGO (Bert de Wel)

- We appreciate the point to look into all the workers not only the obvious one. Try JT processes by sector, get people at the table and they will let you know the workers that are affected.
- JTs chapters in NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDS without the funding are just words.

- We understand challenges are big → 1.4 trillion USD a year to fill the gap. Which is why we need to include the talk of putting the money from fossil fuel taxes, CBAM, etc into this.
- You need to engage with people → need regulatory frameworks to have serious engagement. Not only financial support is needed but also political will

Grenada

- Communication and education → need to understand at community level what is JTs and must be clearly articulated.
- Implementation → policy framework should be very clear and there must be metrics to move forward.
- Communities mustn't see an additional burden of this transition.

iForest

- Discussion has revolved about JT being an implementation agenda so we need to discuss implementation → what kind of support will help the implementation of NDCs.
- Around 50 JT plans at subnational level. Few countries have JETPs as national plans, which give us some idea of support needed → capacity and analytics.
- Huge lack of capacity in terms of understanding impacts and then looking at opportunities and planning to mitigate impacts.
- Second is on finance, no understanding how much will be needed → No methodologies to estimate financial needs for JTs. Are those resources available at national level, how much will be needed from international? Now those are the hard conversations that need to happen.
- India → 60% GDP comes from one industry that will be closed

Angola

- We expected to understand better the right process of identifying support needed at different levels to include the JT into NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDS.
- How are these strategies being implemented?
- Some developing countries are going through cooperation by loans, which in some economies are not the higher priority because in country priorities are more important (food, health, education).
- How should we address and implement these strategies to integrate JT programs.

EU

- Identifying needs → really social dialogues and stakeholders engagements.

- We can also use some instruments like social protection systems that can be reviewed and adapted to provide income security in job transition and climate impacts.
- Also tax benefit systems that can be revised and adapted.

Australia

- Support needs are the challenge of costs. External sources show but needs need to be self-expressed. Articulated using standard methodologies.
- Enhanced transparency frameworks → can also include financial and technology needs to identify needs.

Topic 5: Exploring further Opportunities of International Cooperation for JT

- *What are further international cooperation opportunities to support just transition pathways to achieve NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDs goals?*

Co-chairs remarks

Camila Roman (ILO)

- We've been doing a mapping and base-line to support countries.
- The findings so far will inform how we approach the pillars of support (employment and social impact assessment, facilitation of social dialogue, capacity development and international exchanges, Support for policy development and implementation.
- We need coherent action across policy areas.
- How is JT reflected in climate plans, how are JT policy areas present, what mechanisms and arrangements for policy are envisaged?
- Emerging considerations → still scope for a JT uptake; most plans reflect on impacts which is key; leaving no one behind; JT is seen as relevant in both adaptation and mitigation; employment consideration (job losses and creation) as well as other dimensions (quality of jobs, social protection, heat stress/safety, economic diversification); sectoral perspective still important (energy still very well recognized but also recognized that other sectors are relevant e.g., agriculture and food systems); sectoral and economy-wide approaches; JT as a cross-cutting issues and in specific measures; social dialogue and stakeholder reengagement; policy coordination as JT cannot be the responsibility of a single line ministry; inclusion of JT in NDC...can help international engagement and reorient financial flows.

Ilaria Crotti (UNTAD)

- Holistic character. International cooperation to achieve JT is key.

- Int coop is an enabler of JT → how can we expect ambitious climate policies when they don't have enough for health?
- Least Dev countries need international support.
- Oil exporting countries receive help but are at risk if they don't diversify fast.
- A common JT narrative is needed inside countries and at international level → common shared vision is needed.

ENGO

- This issue of international cooperation opportunities makes us think what are we trying to transition away from → countries with fossil fuel export systems. The biggest threat to a stable climate is the use of fossil fuels. → we need to take into account how we've been relating to nature → JTs also include justice towards mother nature.
- Bigger support and international cooperation for alternative power sources.

EU

- There are a lot of actions that are contributing to JT domestically and internationally within and outside the UNFCCC. Also bilateral green partnerships and JETPs.
- The private sector could also help with 70% of transition process.
- We also need an enabling domestic environments → fiscal policies.

ADB

- We need a deeper conversation about what JT finance is.
- Efforts to include JT goals in climate finance but to reach goals we need to address eco-socio challenges and for that we need different and specific finance for JTs.
- In 2025 we will launch a facility for JTs but we still not clear if that finance will be international in nature or not.

Grenada

- Legal opinions of protection of ecosystems as an opportunity.

TONGO

- Criteria for JT finance → we need to make it clear what we are talking about. Institute for JT and Climate finance we need to integrate that work into JT.
- How can we have a JT in an unjust world. We need the criteria of JT but should not be decoupled from trade policies, debt and other measures.
- Nigeria has received debt related climate finance → we need to deal with this.

iForest

- Finance cooperation → for every dollar that developed world developing have put 5 dollars.
- Developing countries will be the bulk of finance that is needed. But there is a gap that will be required from developed countries.
- JT finance cannot increase the debt burden of developing countries. JETPs are built on loans. What is market and what concessional rate.
- Taxonomy on JT → we need it and is not there yet. Quantitative and qualitative matrix not there yet + clarify role of private investment also needed. How are developed countries arranging their own finance around JT → info shared publicly would be really important.

Egypt

- All sectors and assist countries for a just transition.
- Int cooperation and support of course it exists → currently reasonably concessional support to help in transition. But the problem is that the situation is difficult (debt).
- Role of private sector → yeah but is not the panacea. Don't see the potential of becoming the solution.
- Climate finance as it is now has a lot of problems. Instruments are essential → 65% are market debt rate.
- Private sector will be more comfortable investing in their own developed countries.
- Not just money but also technology. We respect international property rights but we also need to address this to get licences.
- JETPs have been problematic → there are practical issues with these packages.
- Hard to shift money from social services to the transition, unless we fix finance we will go to a slower pace than expected and needed.

Online participant from France (UNESCO?)

- JT is a cross-cutting issue to cultural heritage.
- Transition can be the loss of landmarks (e.g., coalmines).
- Are we sure that new works created will benefit the people.

BINGO

- There a lot of good initiatives (Marrakesh partnership, breakthrough agenda, UNDP, ILO, ADB) we can focus on the existing efforts out there and solutions that are working but still we need to find finance → private sector is very different and wide (e.g., SMEs). There is private sector investment happening but it wont come through until it makes sense for them to do so. Private sector is on the same boat.

- Collaboration areas: developing better anticipatory frameworks and find areas for job creation.

Kenya, Director in conservation online participant

- Relationship between nature, energy and ecosystems

Manal from Oxford

- Energy access is an important issue.
- Investors are investing a lot on renewable energy but sometimes not in those places and sectors that might have the most impact.
- Issue of technology → big opportunity that is untapped. Energy efficiency of the current infrastructure in developing countries. → efficiency measures in themselves can reduce a lot of emissions.

BINGO LinkedIn

- Industry with the lowest concentration of green skills is finance. → it's a greening industry but needs to happen faster.
- JT's topic connecting them to climate finance → to what extent should investments have green skills investments?
- Challenge the notion of skills gap → workers have a lot of skills → more about how do you put signalling?
- How do you facilitate a cross-sector and cross-ministerial collaboration? → need for models.

iForest

- One experience sharing about transforming job in automobile industry when EV comes in.
- Nature of jobs will change from blue to white collar.
- We need to look into education systems.
- What do jobs mean in different contexts/countries.
- We focus a lot of # of job losses. But it's not about absolute number of job losses but also to see where are jobs are being created.

Topic 6: Best Practices: Engaging Support Partners

- *What support from partners is currently available and how can that support be engaged?*
- *How can current engagement with support partners be improved?*

Co-chairs scene setting presentations

Sangji Lee (UNDP)

- UNDP supports NDCs and NAPs. We are one of the biggest implementing partner of NDC partnership.
- Climate Promise 2025 to respond the needs of this revision cycle.
- We coordinate all UN support for NDCs.
- We provide assessment, engagement, institutional policy and capacity support as well as finance.
- Main support is technical and finance support to countries. We also build capacity, intelligence and knowledge, global engagement and communication.
- Flagship report on JTs.

Chantal Line Carpentier (UNCTAD)

- Development plan and trade + align with SDGs.
- We are developing our guidance on how to use trade and investment policies to contribute to JT
- JT plans need to be tailored to national contexts → C-TIF has measurements to see socioeconomic impacts

3 Ice-breaker presentations

US (Katherine)

- US climate finance support provided (mitigation and adaptation finance not separate to JTs) and lessons learnt.
- We do tailor the finance to context and needs.
- Presidents emergence plan for adaptation and resilience (PREPARE) → including developing capacity of finance ministries.
- We are also working in JETP in South Africa -> we recently gave money to retrain coal workers with special focus on women.
- Lessons: there is significant progress, transition takes time and effort, we need to use public finance most effectively, real criticality of robust national enabling environments (key elements: political commitment to climate action in different levels, high levels of mitigation ambition in NDCS and plans, whole of society approach and focus on most vulnerable).

Indonesia

- Need to share the benefits of Transition globally, regionally, nationally and locally.
- We should not be shifting burdens.
- People at the centre.
- Support for JT → only existing support is related to the energy sector.
- To achieve global JT we need to establish processes with wider discussions and scope.
- Critical role of emerging technologies and innovative solutions.

- We need to know in advance the impacts of JT implementation. We need to assess these impacts.

ADB (Kate Huges)

- We need to balance opportunities and risks.
- MDBs agreed on high-level principles of JTs.
- Mobilizing resources to support countries through technical assistance and financing.
- Aligning relevant initiatives and programs.
- Mainstream JT in ADB's operations
- Providing knowledge and collaboration
- We should stop thinking of JT as a reaction, but as an enabling agenda for climate action with distinct financing needs.
- Finance needs flexibility and to be specific on JTs.
- Joint technical assistance platform for DMCs. We are also developing a dedicated JT facility.

iForest

- There are 6 elements that are required for JT: restructuring of the economy, repurposing of existing (fossil fuel) infrastructure, fostering responsible environmental practices, social security to build resilience communities, how do we get (affordable) finance, social dialogue and inclusive decision making.

Australia

- The biannual assessment gives a good overview on the support available.
- Are we talking about bilateral support or a fund? It's a very context specific question. Relevant to unpack.

TUNGO

- Call the representative of workers to engage them.

BINGO

- Data can be really helpful to improve current engagement with partners.
- We can provide some data, so ask us questions.
- IEA has a lot of interesting findings.

EU

- World bank has also launched a new programme for LTS support.
- Still a lot to do in aligning financial flows, still lots of investment goes to fossil fuels. If we take that out a lot of finance can go to a JT.

- There are good overviews of financial flows also in OECD.

The Netherlands

- Would be nice to have tangible examples to tackle (e.g., clean cooking summit in Kenya).
- Clean cooking coverage → we had the political will there and the indication of how to cover it in the country. It might help to include such tangible examples in NDCs.
- The finance needed was concrete and it was doable to cover the entire country with clean cooking.

Closing plenary session: Nathalie Flores Vice-Chair SBASTA

Topic 1: inclusive approaches... → Gulnara Roll (UNEP) report

- Stakeholder engagement is critical as a continuous process through all the parts of policy cycles including in setting objectives, designing plans and implementing.
- Despite examples being context specific commonalities do emerge: policy processes need to be multi-sectoral (with several ministries involved). Examples of breaking silos (e.g., committees).
- Need to engage all stakeholders. NDCs, NAPs, LT-LEDS should be multi-level.
- Private sector engagement was stressed as an important factor. Needs to receive information about JT process and needs an enabling framework for transition.
- Need for stronger access to technologies + professional training → experience provided by Portugal (closing power plant) was very interesting.
- NDCs reps called for support to provide resources.

Experience in incorporating JT... → Mustapha Kamal (ILO) report

- To a variable degree JT aspects have been integrated into climate policies it is a first step to inform on socio-economic and environmental impacts.
- Various (eco models, gender based and analysis tools) → more data and tools would be required + need for data sharing and knowledge sharing systems.
- Importance for institutionalized collaboration mechanisms for a whole of economy and society approach.
- Need for structural change
- Also mention of informal economy and SMEs.
- Involvement of trade unions, human rights, specific subregions, etc.
- People centered JT pathway + stakeholder engagement
- Distributive justice and changing incomes
- Systematic attention to world inequities → role of global trade needs attention
- JT as a driver for implementation and ambition.

Policy coherence for ... → Inkar Kadyrzhanova (FAO) report

- Integration across sectors.
- Incorporating JT in all policies and legislation and aligned with social and environmental policies.
- Inclusive engagement → need to ensure continuous dialogue for acceptability and coherence.
- Financial resources and support → need to support funding → leverage private partnerships.
- Capacity building is an important ingredient to implement JTs.
- Need to anticipate market changes → need to look ahead (also include demo changes).
- Existing or future interministerial mechanisms. Important to engage labour, health, environment, education, etc.
- Policy frameworks need to be comprehensive and aligned with JT and development
- Tracking indicators and metrics are needed.
- Need to establish engagement processes early and send clear signals to investors.
- Need to address financial bottlenecks in the overall public budget.
- International cooperation: guidelines need to be used (e.g., ILO)

Identifying support needs → Miriam Hinostroza report

- Stressing areas: finance, capacity building and tech transfer came up as needs.
- Consideration for people centered processes.
- Identifying financial requirements is a strong need → cost estimates to calculate financial resources (including social dev measures)
- Sector specific needs (including breaking costs and financial needs by sector).
- Issue of temporality → short vs long term.
- Support also needed for financial planning and budgeting.
- Technical support to better understand needs → analytical work, modelling to determine impacts.
- Knowledge sharing is also an important approach → what can be replicated or adapted?
- Modelling as key for scenarios to anticipate and prepare (socio-eco models)
- Modelling will also help identify risks and opportunities associated with different JT pathways.
- In socio-eco support → inclusive consultation process, assessing needs for regulatory frameworks to be revised, adapted, etc.
- Need to assess job impacts, reskilling, etc.
- Need for capacity building → key to enable JT. Understanding JT needs incorporation of local knowledge.

- Capturing workforce comprehensively depends on the country's context.
- Challenging to accessing climate finance is also an issue.
- Solutions to identify support needs systematically → platform approaches were flagged (e.g., databases NDC partnerships also UNFCCC reporting tools).

Best practice...→ Chantale Line (UNCTAD)

- Whole UN system should coordinate support.
- Also country platforms (JETPs) and other bilateral partnerships. Programmes focused on coal phase out also.
- Also support an subnational level
- Request to list all these resources online! And facilitate access to them.
- Still a gap in financing despite → need to scale, ease access, funding from all sources but not increase debt, customized to national and local needs, align with SDGs, include trade.
- Public and private investment will be needed. International partners should have tangible support.
- JT pathways should consider food, water, access to affordable energy, land, agriculture, migration, etc.
- Multisector inclusive engagement → needed early to implement transition.
- Partnership to support eco and sustainable growth.
- Strengthening local capacity + support and assistance can be scaled up.
- There is an increased fragmentation of development support. It's a concern.

Exploring further opportunities...--> Camila Roman (ILO) report back

- Consider issues like debt.
- JT is both in relation to mitigation and adaptation (areas: job impacts, improving energy efficiency and access, health, adaptation water, ecosystems, etc)
- Job creation, repurposing of assets, call for need a social and environmental dimensions of climate projects.
- JTs should encompass different sectors.
- Skills and education are also important → youth engagement.
- Key to have inclusive stakeholder engagement process and ensure rights.
- Without means of implementation there cannot be action.
- Need to scale up and align financial flows to a JT → avoid that this finance imposes additional debt burdens. → grants are needed
- Yes finance, but it requires policy signals and an enabling governance environment.
- Tech and capacity building are key.

COP29 (Elchin Senior Negotiator) and COP30 (Mario Mottin Deputy Head of Delegation) incoming presidencies.

- JTs more than a mere slogan.
- As we approach COP29 we need to set up financial mechanisms that prioritise social and economic.

COP30 (Mario Mottin Deputy Head of Delegation)

- Fundamental debate to pave way to COPs.
- Pathways to achieve sust dev and eradication of poverty
- JT pathways are those that promote long term growth inclusion and..
- Mitigation, adaptation, finance, tech and capacity building.
- The transition must be just → needs to address inequalities in terms of SDGs,
- Need of a cross-cutting perspective → whole of gov approach needed and cross-sectional participation.
- The drafting of NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDS should include consultations → social participation is key.
- CBDR&RC → key in JT pathways (financing, capacity building, tech transfer is needed to include JT in NDCs, NAPs and LT-LEDS)

SBS closing remarks

- We will prepare a summary report.